

PEGGY A. WHIPPLE (MO 54758)  
[peggy.whipple@psc.mo.gov](mailto:peggy.whipple@psc.mo.gov)  
 Attorney for Missouri Public Service Commission  
 LINDA CONTI (ME 3638)  
[Linda.Conti@maine.gov](mailto:Linda.Conti@maine.gov)  
 Assistant Attorney General of Maine  
 PATRICK DEALMEIDA  
[patrick.dealmeida@dol.lps.state.nj.us](mailto:patrick.dealmeida@dol.lps.state.nj.us)  
 Assistant Attorney General of New Jersey  
 TATIANA D. EIRMANN (CT 03398)  
[tatiana.eirmann@po.state.ct.us](mailto:tatiana.eirmann@po.state.ct.us)  
 Assistant Attorney General of Connecticut  
 MICHAEL DONOFRIO (VT 4400)  
[mdonofrio@atg.state.vt.us](mailto:mdonofrio@atg.state.vt.us)  
 Assistant Attorney General of Vermont

[Additional counsel for states appear on signature page.]

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

IN RE NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY )	MDL Docket No. 06-1791 VRW
TELECOMMUNICATIONS RECORDS )	
LITIGATION, MDL No. 1791 )	Relates to Case Nos.
)	
This Document Relates To: )	
)	07-cv-1187-VRW
<u>Robert Clayton, et al. v. AT&amp;T</u> )	07-cv-1242-VRW
<u>Communications of the Southwest, Inc.,</u> )	07-cv-1323-VRW
<u>et al., (W.D.Mo.)</u> )	07-cv-1324-VRW
<u>USA v. Steve Gaw, et al., (E.D.Mo.)</u> )	07-cv-1326-VRW
<u>USA v. Kurt Adams, et al., (D.Me.)</u> )	07-cv-1396-VRW
<u>USA v. Zulima V. Farber, et al., (D.N.J.)</u> )	
<u>USA v. Anthony J. Palermino,</u> )	
<u>et al., (D.Ct.)</u> )	<b>STATE OFFICIALS'</b>
<u>USA v. James Volz, et al., (D.Vt.)</u> )	<b>CONSOLIDATED BRIEF OF</b>
)	<b>NINTH CIRCUIT LAW IN FURTHER</b>
)	<b>SUPPORT OF PENDING</b>
)	<b>DISPOSITIVE MOTIONS</b>
)	
)	Date: June 14, 2007
)	Time 2:00 p.m.
)	Courtroom: 6, 17 <sup>th</sup> Floor
)	Judge: The Hon. Vaughn R. Walker

# TABLE OF AUTHORITIES ERRATA

## Cases:

<i>Abbott Laboratories v. Gardner</i> , 387 U.S. 136 (1967).....	19
<i>Aetna Life Ins. Co. v. Haworth</i> , 300 U.S. 227 (1937).....	21, 22
<i>American-Arab Anti-Discrimination Comm. v. Thornburgh</i> , 970 F.2d 501 (9th Cir. 1992).....	21
<i>Ass’n of Am. Med. Colls v. United States</i> , 217 F.3d 770 (9th Cir. 2000).....	19, 20
<i>AT&amp;T Corp. v. Iowa Utils. Bd.</i> , 525 U.S. 366 (1999).....	8
<i>Baker &amp; Drake, Inc. v. Pub. Serv. Comm’n of Nev.</i> , 35 F.3d 1348 (9th Cir. 1994).....	11, 12
<i>Boating Indus. Ass’ns. v. Marshall</i> , 601 F.2d 1376 (9th Cir. 1979).....	23
<i>Califano v. Sanders</i> , 430 U.S. 99 (1977) .....	19
<i>Cipollone v. Liggett Group, Inc.</i> , 505 U.S. 504 (1992) .....	9
<i>Corr. Servs. Corp. v. Malesko</i> , 534 U.S. 61 (2001) .....	18
<i>Ctr. for Bio-Ethical Reform, Inc. v. City &amp; County of Honolulu</i> , 455 F.3d 910 (9th Cir. 2006) .....	11, 12
<i>FCC v. Pacifica Found.</i> , 438 U.S. 726 (1978) .....	21
<i>Fed. Reserve Bank of Boston v. Comm’r of Corps. and Taxation</i> , 499 F.2d 60 (1st Cir. 1974).....	15
<i>Franklin v. Massachusetts</i> , 505 U.S. 788 (1992).....	20
<i>Friends of the Earth, Inc. v. Laidlaw Envtl. Servs. (TOC), Inc.</i> , 528 U.S. 167 (2000).....	23
<i>Gov’t Employees Ins. Co. v. Dizol</i> , 133 F.3d 1220 (9th Cir. 1998).....	16
<i>Hancock v. Train</i> , 426 U.S. 167 (1976).....	11, 13
<i>Hepting v. AT&amp;T Corp.</i> , 439 F. Supp. 2d 974 (N.D. Cal. 2006) .....	12, 13, 16

<i>Hisquierdo v. Hisquierdo</i> , 439 U.S. 572 (1979) .....	10, 11
<i>Incolza v. Fendi N. Am., Inc.</i> , 479 F.3d 1005 (9th Cir. 2007) .....	9, 10, 11
<i>Indus. Communications Sys., Inc. v. Pac. Tel. &amp; Tel. Co.</i> , 505 F.2d 152 (9th Cir. 1974) .....	21
<i>Jones v. Rath Packing Co.</i> , 430 U.S. 519 (1977).....	9, 10
<i>Kroske v. U.S. Bank Corp.</i> , 432 F.3d 976 (9th Cir. 2005) .....	9
<i>League of Women Voters of Cal. v. Fed. Communications Comm’n</i> , 489 F. Supp. 517 (C.D. Cal. 1980) .....	23
<i>Maryland Cas. Co. v. Pac. Coal &amp; Oil Co.</i> , 312 U.S. 270 (1941) .....	22
<i>Middlesex County Ethics Committee v. Garden State Bar Association</i> , 457 U.S. 423 (1982).....	15
<i>Moore v. Charlotte-Mecklenburg Bd. Of Educ.</i> , 402 U.S. 47 (1971).....	23
<i>Municipality of Anchorage v. United States</i> , 980 F.2d 1320 (9th Cir. 1992) .....	19
<i>New Orleans Pub. Serv., Inc. v. Council of City of New Orleans</i> , 491 U.S. 350 (1989).....	8
<i>New York Times v. United States</i> , 403 U.S. 713 (1971) .....	17, 18
<i>Pac. Gas &amp; Elec. Co. v. California</i> , 350 F.3d 932 (9th Cir. 2003) .....	9
<i>Principal Life Ins. Co. v. Robinson</i> , 394 F.3d 665 (9th Cir. 2005).....	19
<i>Public Affairs Associates v. Rickover</i> , 369 U.S. 111 (1962).....	16
<i>Sacks v. Office of Foreign Assets Control</i> , 466 F.3d 764 (9th Cir. 2006) .....	23
<i>Skysign Int’l, Inc. v. City &amp; County of Honolulu</i> , 276 F.3d 1109 (9th Cir. 2002).....	11, 12
<i>Smelt v. County of Orange</i> , 447 F.3d 673 (9th Cir. 2006).....	23
<i>Sosa v. Alvarez-Machain</i> , 542 U.S. 692 (2004).....	18
<i>Stewart v. M.M. &amp; P. Pension Plan</i> , 608 F.2d 776 (9th Cir. 1979).....	22

<i>Terkel v. AT&amp;T</i> , 441 F. Supp. 2d 899 (N.D. Ill. 2006) .....	13
<i>The Coalition for a Healthy Cal. v. Fed. Communications Comm’n</i> , 87 F.3d 383 (9th Cir. 1996) .....	21
<i>Ting v. AT&amp;T</i> , 319 F.3d 1126 (9th Cir. 2003) .....	9, 10, 11, 12
<i>Thomas v. Anchorage Equal Rights Comm’n</i> , 220 F.3d 1134 (9th Cir. 2000).....	21
<i>TOPA Equities, Ltd. v. City of Los Angeles</i> , 342 F.3d 1065 (9th Cir. 2003).....	10, 11
<i>Total TV v. Palmer Communications, Inc.</i> , 69 F.3d 298 (9th Cir. 1995) .....	11, 13
<i>United States v. Adams</i> , 2007 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 9351 (D. Me. Feb. 8, 2007).....	2, 3
<i>United States v. Marchetti</i> , 466 F.2d 1309 (4th Cir. 1972) .....	17, 18
<i>United States v. Mattson</i> , 600 F.2d 1294 (9th Cir. 1979) .....	16, 17, 18
<i>United States v. Morros</i> , 268 F.3d 695 (9th Cir. 2001) .....	15, 16
<i>United States v. Ohio</i> , 614 F.2d 101 (6th Cir. 1979) .....	15
<i>United States v. Solomon</i> , 563 F.2d 1121 (4th Cir. 1977) .....	17, 18
<i>Volt Info. Science, Inc. v. Bd. of Trs. Of the Leland Stamford, Jr. Univer.</i> , 489 U.S. 468 (1989).....	10
<i>W.E.B. DuBois Clubs of America v. Clark</i> , 389 U.S. 309 (1967).....	21
<i>Wilton v. Seven Falls Co.</i> , 515 U.S. 277 (1995) .....	16
<i>Winter v. Cal. Med. Review, Inc.</i> , 900 F.2d 1322 (9th Cir. 1990) .....	19
<i>Younger v. Harris</i> , 401 U.S. 37 (1971).....	15, 16

#### **Constitution and Statutes:**

18 U.S.C. § 798.....	12
28 U.S.C. § 1345.....	19

47 U.S.C. § 201(b) .....	10, 12
50 U.S.C. § 402, Note .....	12, 13, 14
50 U.S.C. § 403-1(i)(1) .....	12, 13, 14
Conn. Gen. Stat. § 16-1(4) and (25) .....	5
30 V.S.A. § 9 .....	7, 16
30 V.S.A. § 206 .....	6

#### **Other Authorities:**

Executive Orders 12958 and 13292 .....	12
Kevin Beck, Note, <i>The Ninth Circuit's Message to Nevada: You're Not Getting Any Younger</i> , 3 Nev. L.J. 592 (2003) .....	15
Niraj Warikoo, <i>ACLU: Companies Violated Privacy</i> , The Detroit Free Press, July 27, 2006 .....	14
James Risen, <i>Legislation Seeks to Ease Rules on Domestic Spying</i> , The New York Times, A13, April 14, 2007 .....	14
U.S. Department of Justice, Office of the Inspector General, <i>A Review of the Federal Bureau of Investigation's Use of National Security Letters</i> , March 2007, <a href="http://www.usdoj.gov/oig/special/s0703b/final.pdf">http://www.usdoj.gov/oig/special/s0703b/final.pdf</a> .....	14